Arabidopsis floral homeotic gene BELL (BEL1) controls ovule development through negative regulation of AGAMOUS gene (AG)


Arabidopsis floral homegene BELL (BEL1) controls ovule development through negative regulation of AGAMOUS gene (AG)

ANIMESH RAY*, KAY ROBINSON-BEERS†, SUMITA RAY*, SHAWN C. BAKER†, JEAN D. LANG*, DAPHNE PREUSS*, STEPHEN B. MILLIGAN†, AND CHARLES S. GASSER‡

*Department of Biology, University of Rochester, Rochester, NY 14627; †Section of Molecular and Cellular Biology, Division of Biological Sciences, University of California, Davis, CA 95616; and ‡Department of Biochemistry, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305

Communicated by Paul K. Stumpf, February 18, 1994 (received for review February 4, 1994)

ABSTRACT Ovules are the developmental precursors of seeds. In angiosperms the ovules are enclosed within the central floral organs, the carpels. We have identified a homeotic mutation in Arabidopsis, "bell" (bell), which causes transformation of ovule integuments into carpels. In situ hybridization analysis shows that this mutation leads to increased expression of the carpel-determining homeotic gene AGAMOUS (AG) in the mutant ovules. Introduction of a constitutively expressed AG transgene into wild-type plants causes the ovules to resemble those of bell mutants. We propose that the BELL gene product directs normal integument development, in part by suppressing AG expression in this structure. Our results allow expansion of the current model of floral organ identity to include regulation of ovule integument identity.

A typical angiosperm flower includes four major organ types—sepal, petals, stamens, and carpels. The carpels include an additional set of distinct internal structures, the ovules. As the precursors of seeds, ovules play an essential role in higher plant sexual reproduction. Ovules are also found in gymnosperms, which lack carpels, and fossil evidence of angiosperm ancestors demonstrates that ovules predate the evolution of carpels (1–3). Thus, ovules evolved first, with subsequent evolution of the enclosing carpel. From this perspective, ovules can be viewed as separate floral organs, which, in angiosperms, develop from and are enclosed within the carpels.

Little is known concerning the genetic control of determination and differentiation of ovules. This contrasts with recent progress in elucidation of control of development of other floral organs, where analysis of floral homeotic mutants in Arabidopsis thaliana and Antirrhinum majus has led to the formulation of two similar models for genetic determination of the identity of the four major floral organs (4–8). In Arabidopsis, at least five genes—APETALA1 (AP1), APETALA2 (AP2), APETALA3 (AP3), PISTILLATA (PI), and AGAMOUS (AG)—are responsible for this determination (5, 8–11). Several of these genes have now been cloned and found to be homologous to known transcription factors identified in yeast and mammals (12–15). One of these genes, AG, important for carpel identity (5, 8, 16), is also potentially involved in ovule development. The expression of AG occurs both early and late in flower development (16). Early AG expression, uniform in the carpel, determines the identity of this organ, whereas its late expression, restricted to compartments of carpels and ovules, may regulate specific cell fates (16). Two other Arabidopsis genes, BEL1 and SIN1, mutations of which lead to aberrant ovules (17), specifically control ovule development. Here we show that several new bell alleles cause the homeotic transformation of ovule integuments into carpels, that this transformation is associated with overexpression of AG in these tissues, and that ectopic expression of AG from an introduced transgene can produce the same homeotic transformation. We propose an extension of an existing model of genetic control of floral organ identity to include BEL1 as a negative regulator of AG within ovules.

MATERIALS AND METHODS Plant Material and Genetic Analysis. Arabidopsis ecotypes Landsberg erecta (Ler) and Columbia (Co-3) were obtained from Lehle Seed (Tucson, AZ), and No-0 was a gift from John Harada (Univ. of California, Davis). Plants were grown as described (18). Additional alleles of bell were isolated as described for bell-1 (17). Allelism was established by complementation tests. All bell alleles were recessive to wild type, indicating that they probably represent loss-of-function mutations. Linkage of bell to ttg was deduced from segregation ratios in 246 F2 progeny plants derived from crosses with strains having multiple markers (19) using the MAPMAKER computer program (20). Mapping relative to RFLP (restriction fragment length polymorphism) (21) was performed on F2 progeny (96 chromosomes analyzed) from a bell-1/bell-1 Ler × Co-3 cross. RFLP probes were M247 (Bgl II digestions) and g4028 (HindIII digestions). To determine the frequency of integument-to-carpel transformation in different alleles, ovules in >150 pistils from at least three different plants for each allele were scored for carpelloid features.

Microscopy and in situ Hybridization. Scanning electron microscopy was performed as described (17). In situ hybridization was carried out as described earlier (22). 35S-labeled sense and antisense RNA probes (≈106 cpm/μg) were made from AG cDNA clone pCIT565 as described (15). Probing with sense RNA gave uniformly low nonspecific background of silver grains. For measurement of surface density of autoradiographic grains, the images were digitized off the microscope and quantitated by using the IMAGE 1 image processor program. The grain surface density was total grain area divided by the total selected area. Wild-type and bell-1 ovules obtained from late stage 14 flowers (16) were treated in the same experiment. Only exposures providing subsaturated grains were counted. For wild-type ovules, the area delimited by the endothelium and the embryo sac was not counted. The mean grain surface density (±SD) before background correction in the integument area on sections of wild-type ovules probed with anti-AG was 0.029 (±0.0007) (10 ovules counted), and that for bell-1 ovules with the same probe was 0.076 (±0.046) (13 ovules counted). The difference

The publication costs of this article were defrayed in part by page charge payment. This article must therefore be hereby marked "advertisement" in accordance with 18 U.S.C. §1734 solely to indicate this fact.

Abbreviation: RFLP, restriction fragment length polymorphism. ‡To whom reprint requests should be addressed.

5761
between the two means is highly significant (Student’s $t$ test $= -3.134$ for unequal variance; $P = 0.005$) (23). The mean background grain density was 0.02 ± 0.001, and the corrected means differed by a factor of >6.

**Plant Transformation.** Transformation of *Arabidopsis* ecotype No-0 was performed as described (24) with the Ti plasmid p35S-BAG (25). Seed was collected from 10 independent transgenic plants. Two of the resulting lines (TA4 and TA10) included plants that displayed the Bel1- phenotype but were otherwise normal.

**RESULTS**

**Integuments Are Converted to Carpels in bell Mutants.** A mature wild-type flower of *Arabidopsis thaliana* contains approximately 50 ovules within the bicaudellate gynoecium. Ovules are initiated as small finger-like primordia from the internal surface of carpels (the placentas) (17). An inner and an outer integument arise from the surface of each primordium, their site of origin demarcating the boundary between the apical nucellus and the supporting stalk (funiculus) of the ovule. The integuments grow to cover the nucellus and meet at the tip, leaving a small opening (the micropyle) (Fig. 1A). Within the nucellus a megasporocyte differentiates and undergoes meiosis, and one meiotic product develops into a seven-celled megagametophyte (26, 27). The nucellus then degenerates, and the innermost cell layer of the integuments differentiates into the endothelium that surrounds the embryo sac (17). After fertilization the ovule will develop into a seed, with the integuments forming the seed coat.

Plants homozygous for mutations in *bell* exhibit normal gross morphology but are female-sterile as a result of aberrant ovule development (17). In ovules of the original *bell* mutant (*bell-1*), a structure that initially resembles the outer integument initiates but develops abnormally into a collar-like structure, producing the characteristic bell-shaped ovules (17) (Fig. 1B). There is no evidence of formation of a separate inner integument. Meiosis occurs in the nucellus, but a normal embryo sac is not formed (17). Most *bell-1* ovules do not develop further and degenerate. We have mapped *bell* to chromosome 5 at 21.5 centimorgans (cM) from *ttg*, and 3.2 cM and 13.3 cM from RFLP markers m247 and g4028, respectively (with the order *ttg*, *bell*, m247, g4028).

We isolated five additional alleles of *bell*, which allowed us to define the critical role of the wild-type *BELI* gene in controlling ovule development. In nearly every pistil of plants homozygous for *bell-4*, -5, or -6, one or more ovules develop

---

**Fig. 1.** Scanning electron micrographs of wild-type and mutant flower parts. (A) Ovules of wild-type plants at anthesis. The outer integuments (oi) cover the inner integuments and nucelli (not visible). (Bar = 25 μm.) (B) Ovules of the *bell-1* mutant at anthesis. The nucellus (n) is exposed, and the integuments are replaced by a collar of tissue (ct). (Bar = 30 μm.) (C) Ovules of the *bell-4* mutant at anthesis. The collars of tissue cover the nucelli but do not resemble wild-type integuments. (Bar = 40 μm.) (D) Ectopic carpel deriving from an ovule of a *bell-4* mutant. A stigma (s) has formed where the carpel has closed. (Bar = 50 μm.) (E) Epidermis of stylar region of carpelloid ovule of *bell-4* mutant. Arrow indicates stomate (Bar = 10 μm.) (F) Epidermis of stylar region of wild-type carpel. Arrows indicate stomates (Bar = 10 μm.) (G) Unclosed ectopic carpel of *bell-4* mutant. (Bar = 70 μm.) (H) Unclosed ectopic carpel of *bell-4* mutant showing secondary ovules (arrows). (Bar = 90 μm.) (I) Detail of ovules shown in H. (Bar = 20 μm.) (J) Ovules of transgenic plant containing the 35S-AG expression vector. (Bar = 30 μm.) m, Microstyle; f, funiculus.
into structures that resemble carpels. In these ovules the collar of tissue that replaces the integuments elongates to cover the nucellus (Fig. 1C) and then develops into a carpel-like cylinder with stigmatic papillae at the apex (Fig. 1D). The exterior surface of the cylinder differentiates into an epidermis with characteristic cell shape, surface features, and stomata of the normal carpel outer epidermis (Fig. 1 E and F). The length of the entire structure is variable as is the position of the transformed bell ovules. In some cases the structure does not fully close but still develops the features of a normal carpel (Fig. 1G). The phenotype of bell mutants is iterative, with secondary ovules that display the Bell- phenotype forming on the interior surface of the carpelloid ovules (Fig. 1H and I). We conclude that the integuments are converted into carpels in this subset of bell ovules.

The frequency of fully carpelloid ovules shows an allelic series from fewer than one per 2500 ovules in the weakest alleles (bell-1, -7, -8) to an average of one in eight ovules in the most severe (bell-5). Even in the weakest alleles there is evidence for partial conversion of the ovules to carpels. In approximately 15% of the bell-shaped ovules in bell-1 mutants, the nucellus contains a differentiated tracheary element (Fig. 2A) similar to elements present in wild-type carpels (Fig. 2B). Since vascular tissue in wild-type Arabidopsis ovules normally extends only slightly above the funiculus, these ectopic vascular elements may indicate partial conversion into carpelloid tissue. However, it is yet unclear if the nucellus also participates in the formation of the ectopic carpel structures that derive primarily from the integuments.

**bell Ovules Ectopically Express AG.** The correlation between the site of AG expression and the eventual appearance of carpels or carpelloid structures (15, 16, 22) led us to postulate that aberrant AG expression could be responsible for the homeotic transformation of bell mutant ovules. We tested this hypothesis by in situ hybridization of sections of ovules with 35S-labeled anti-AG cDNA (Fig. 2 C–F). In late stage 14 (after anthesis) wild-type ovules, AG expression is high in the endothelial cells and low in other integument layers (Fig. 2 C and D), confirming the results of Bowman et al. (16). By contrast, a significant level of AG message is found distributed uniformly within the bell-1 ovules in flowers at this same developmental stage (Fig. 2 E and F). We quantitated the in situ hybridization signal (the number of autoradiographic grains per unit area) on sections of several wild-type and bell-1 ovules. The level of AG mRNA in the collar of tissue that replaces the integuments in mutant ovules was significantly higher than that observed in the wild-type integuments, and this difference was even more pronounced when corrected for background. We conclude that the cells in the collar of tissue that replaces the integuments in a mature bell ovule actively express AG and propose that one role of BEL1 is to suppress AG expression directly or indirectly in developing integuments.

**Ectopic AG Expression Results in a Phenocopy of the bell Mutant.** While the above experiments demonstrate an association between the bell mutation and ectopic expression of AG in the integuments, they do not imply a causal relationship between this expression and the homeotic transformation of the ovules. The role of AG expression in the bell phenotype can be directly tested through induced overexpression of AG in otherwise wild-type plants. A T-DNA construct in which expression of the Brassica napus homolog of AG is driven by the strong "constitutive" 35S promoter of cauliflower mosaic virus (25) was introduced into wild-type

**Fig. 2.** Cleared whole mount and in situ hybridization analysis of bell-1 ovules. (A) A cleared ovule of bell-1 mutant showing differentiated tracheary element (t) in the nucellus (n) that projects out of the collar of tissue (ct) forming the main body of the mutant ovule. (B) Cleared stylar region (sy) of a wild-type pistil. Tracheary elements occur in profusion below the stigmatic papillae (s) with germinated pollen grains (p). Ovules and carpel were cleared (28) and photographed under Nomarski optics. (C) Section of a wild-type ovule at anthesis hybridized with the AG antisense probe. Orange grains represent hybridization signals. Most AG mRNA is seen in the single-cell layered endothelium (e) surrounding the embryo sac (es). Two integumentary layers (i) that surround the endothelium show much lower levels of hybridization. The funiculus (f) is attached at the base of the ovule. (D) Bright-field view of the same section as in C. The micropylar end of the ovule (m) does not have an endothelial lining. (E) Section through bell-1 mutant ovules at anthesis hybridized with AG antisense probe. Hybridization signal is uniformly high over the collar of tissue (ct). (F) Bright-field view of the same section as in E. (Bars = 42 μm in A and B; 48 μm in C, D, E, and F.)
Arabidopsis plants. While ovules of the primary transgenic lines were wild type, progeny of two independent lines produced only bell-shaped ovules (Fig. 1 J) or ovules in which the integuments had undergone a complete conversion to carpels (data not shown). The transgenic plants were normal in all other respects. Thus, AG overexpression is sufficient to duplicate the effects of loss of BELL1 gene function, producing an exact phenocopy of the bell mutant.

**DISCUSSION**

In summary, the above results show: (i) The integuments of some ovules in bell plants are homeotically converted to carpels; (ii) the average level of AG mRNA in bell ovules is higher than that observed in wild-type ovule integuments; (iii) constitutive AG expression in transgenic plants causes the formation of phenotypically Bell− ovules.

The simplest interpretation of these results is that BELL1 is a regulatory gene that restricts late AG expression in the integuments and that BELL1 controls ovule development via its negative regulation of AG. In this view, unrestricted AG expression in bell mutant ovules or constitutive expression of an AG transgene in a transformant causes the conversion of ovule integuments into a carpel. It is possible that a complete conversion requires at least a threshold level of AG expression. Thus, not all ovules in bell mutants are completely transformed, and the frequency of transformation varies among different bell alleles with various levels of residual BELL1 activity. That we could produce phenocopies of bell mutants in transgenic Arabidopsis, using a constitutively expressed AG homologue is consistent with previous results in which the same construct was introduced into tobacco plants (25). A subset of ovules of these transgenic tobacco plants were converted to style-like structures with terminal stigmatic papillae (25), an indication of a partial ovule to carpel conversion. Thus, ectopic expression of AG appears to be sufficient to produce phenotypically Bell− ovules in two different species. Because the ovules in the transgenic tobacco plants were similar to previously described "stigmatoid ovules" of two tobacco mutants mgr3 and mgr9 (25, 29), it is possible that these mutations also alter AG expression in the ovules.

In addition to having carpelloid ovules, the transgenic tobacco plants overexpressing AG (25) exhibited properties similar to Arabidopsis apetala2 (ap2) mutants in that their sepals were converted to carpelloid structures and their petals were converted to stamens. Mizukami and Ma (30) also found that overexpression of AG in Arabidopsis led to phenocopies of ap2 mutants, but they report that the ovules of these plants were morphologically normal. These results contrast with ours in which bell-shaped or fully carpelloid ovules were observed in plants that were otherwise normal. However, in other experiments, the vector we used was capable of producing Ap2− phenocopies in Arabidopsis (M. Yanofsky, personal communication). The best explanation for these results is that independent transformants may have different levels of expression of the transgene, and that the tissue-specificity of this expression may also vary.

Our results allow an extension of the current genetic model of floral organ identity to include control of ovule integument identity (Fig. 3). In our extended model, the proposed role for BELL1 in the ovule exactly parallels a previous example of negative regulation of AG in the sepal by AP2. In strong ap2 mutants, the sepals are converted to carpels or carpelloid structures (5, 31), and AG is ectopically expressed in these structures (22). As noted above, transgenes that constitutively express AG can lead to phenocopies of the ap2 mutant (25, 30), besides exhibiting phenotypically Bell− ovules (see above). It has been proposed that one function of AP2 is to negatively regulate the expression of AG in the sepals of...
wild-type flowers (5) (Fig. 3A). By analogy, our extended model (Fig. 3B) explains the phenotypes observed in both bell mutants and in plants containing the constitutive A G transgene (Fig. 3 C and D) with the postulate that BELI negatively regulates A G. Thus, A G expression in the flower may be controlled at several places by different regulators. A G expression is negatively regulated by BELI in ovules, and by AP2 in sepals. In addition, A G may be negatively regulated in anthers by an as yet unidentified gene because A G expression is restricted in this organ (16), and plants constitutively expressing A G can be male sterile (25, 30).

While more complex models wherein bell indirectly effects ovule-to-carpel transformation are possible, our proposal appears to be the simplest. Our observation that ovule integuments can be converted to a carpel by the loss of a single gene may have implications for theories on the evolutionary origins of integuments and carpels, a topic that remains controversial (1, 2, 32). In combination with ongoing research on the determination of major floral organs (4–8), further studies on bell and on additional mutations affecting ovule development will allow construction of increasingly predictive and accurate molecular-genetic models of flower and ovule ontogeny.

Note Added in Proof. Similar results concerning carpelloid ovules and ectopic expression of A G in bell mutants were recently reported (33).

We thank Elliot Meyerowitz for providing pCIT56; Martin Yanofsky for p3SS-BAG; Detlef Weigel and Lynne Angerer for instructions on in situ hybridization; and Lynne Angerer, John Bowman, Judy Callis, Tom Eckbush, J. Christopher Gaier, and J. Clark Lagarias for critical reviews of the manuscript. This work was supported by Cooperative State Research Service Awards, U. S. Department of Agriculture 92-37304-7966 (to A.R.) and 92-37304-7756 (to C.S.G.), U. S. Department of Agriculture National Needs Graduate Fellowship (to S.C.B.), and National Science Foundation Postdoctoral Fellowships in Plant Biology (to K.R.-B. and D.F.).