Asteroid break-ups and meteorite delivery to Earth the past 500 million years

Fredrik Terfelta and Birger Schmitza,b,1

*Astrogeobiology Laboratory, Department of Physics, Lund University, 221 00 Lund, Sweden; and 1Robert A. Pritzker Center for Meteoritics and Polar Studies, Negaunee Integrative Research Center, Field Museum of Natural History, Chicago, IL 60605

Edited by William F. Bottke, Southwest Research Institute, and accepted by Editorial Board Member Donald E. Canfield April 21, 2021 (received for review October 7, 2020)

The meteoritic material falling on Earth is believed to derive from large break-up or cratering events in the asteroid belt. The flux of extraterrestrial material would then vary in accordance with the timing of such asteroid family-forming events. In order to validate this, we investigated marine sediments representing 15 time-windows in the Phanerozoic for content of micrometeoritic relict chrome-spinel grains (>32 μm). We compare these data with the timing of the 15 largest break-up events involving chrome-spinel-bearing asteroids (S- and V-types). Unexpectedly, our Phanerozoic time windows show a stable flux dominated by ordinary chondrites similar to today’s flux. Only in the mid-Ordovician, in connection with the break-up of the L-chondrite parent body, do we observe an anomalous micrometeorite regime with a two to three orders-of-magnitude increase in the flux of L-chondrite chrome-spinel grains to Earth. This corresponds to a one order-of-magnitude excess in the number of impact craters in the mid-Ordovician following the L-chondrite break-up, the only resolvable peak in Phanerozoic cratering rates indicative of an asteroid shower. We argue that meteorites and small (<1-km-sized) asteroids impacting Earth mainly sample a very small region of orbital space in the asteroid belt. This selectiveness has been remarkably stable over the past 500 Ma.

Author contributions: F.T. and B.S. designed research, performed research, contributed new reagents/analytic tools, analyzed data, and wrote the paper.

The authors declare no competing interest.

This article is a PNAS Direct Submission. W.F.B. is a guest editor invited by the Editorial Board.

This open access article is distributed under Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivatives License 4.0 (CC BY-NC-ND).

1To whom correspondence may be addressed. Email: birger.schmitz@nuclear.lu.se.

Significance

The standard view of meteorite delivery to Earth is that of the cascading model where large asteroid break-ups generate new fragment populations that feed the inner solar system with material for extended time periods. Our investigated time windows, stretching from the Cambrian to the present, do not support this model. In fact, of 70 major family-forming break-ups the past ~500 Ma, only 1 appears to have given rise to a strongly enhanced flux to Earth. We argue that meteorites and small asteroids delivered to Earth in deep time are not primarily linked to the sequence of asteroid family-forming events. Another, as yet unknown, delivery process appears to be associated with a very restricted region in the asteroid belt.
Around 1 to 1.7 Ga ago the 500-km-sized Rheasilvia basin formed on the south pole of 4 Vesta by the impact of an ∼40-km-sized body. Possibly, there was also a second, later lower-energy impact of an ∼20-km-sized body on 4 Vesta, but the claim is ambiguous (15–17). Following the cascading concept laid out above, at least the 15 largest family-forming break-up events (with more than ∼500 members) presented in Fig. 2 should have produced large amounts of fine dust that would have reached Earth a few hundred thousand to a few million years later (Fig. 2). The robustness of our chrome-spinel data varies between different time windows, but we are confident that the present “first-order” dataset supports our main conclusions. The validity of our approach is supported by the high level of reproducibility of results for the same time windows at different sites in China, Russia, and Sweden. For example, the results for the mid-Ordovician window just before the L-chondrite parent body (LCPB) break-up as registered at Lynna River in Russia and Hällekis in Sweden, localities 1,100-km apart on the same paleocontinent, are very similar (Table 1 and SI Appendix, Table S1) (18). Previous research has shown that sediment-dispersed chrome-spinel grains mainly originate from unmelted micrometeorites in the size range 30 to 2,000 μm (1, 4, 18). The flux in this size fraction has been shown to correlate...
with the flux of larger meteorites (e.g., in the size interval 1 to 20 cm).

Results

Our chrome-spinel data show an intriguing pattern where the LCPB break-up 466 Ma ago constitutes a conspicuous anomaly during a 500 million y more-or-less constant ordinary chondritic flux. Throughout the Phanerozoic, except following the LCPB event, the flux of ordinary chondritic chrome spinel appears to have been stable in the range of ~0.1 to 0.5 grains (>63 μm) m⁻² kyr⁻¹. During circa 2 million y following the LCPB event, the flux increases by a factor of ~100 to 300 and the chrome-spinel assemblages are almost entirely (>99%) made up of L-chondritic grains (18). The increased flux of micrometeorites from this event tailed off, but continued into Silurian times, when it finally reached background values after some 40 million y (3) (Fig. 2). Even today, this break-up is the source of almost one-third of all meteorites falling on Earth. In all other time windows, the total flux lies at background levels and the ratios between grains from equilibrated ordinary chondrites (EC grains) and other chrome-spinel bearing meteorite types (OtC-V grains) show that ordinary chondrites dominated the flux among chrome-spinel–yielding meteorite types (Table 1). The OtC-V grains do not have the typical equilibrated ordinary chondritic composition, but have high vanadium content that generally distinguishes extraterrestrial from terrestrial spinels (see Materials and Methods for a detailed discussion). For 2 of our 15 time windows we also have three oxygen isotopic data for the OtC-V grains recovered, allowing a more precise characterization of their origin. In the oldest Early Cretaceous window, about one-third of the OtC-V grains have an oxygen isotopic composition indicative of the howardite, eucrite, diogenite (HED) types of meteorites (2). Another third of the grains represent unequilibrated ordinary chondritic grains, and the remainder originate from primitive (e.g., winonaites, lodranites, acapulcoites) or ungrouped or anomalous achondrites.

Previously, we have reported a rather low (~1.1) EC/OtC-V ratio in the 63- to 355-μm fraction just before the LCPB break-up (10). The oxygen isotopic studies of the mid-Ordovician OtC-V grains show that a substantial fraction of them originate from different types of primitive achondrites rarely seen in the present flux (10). We see similar low EC/OtC-V ratios also in some of the other time windows, but the flux of EC grains remains stable at background levels and ordinary chondrites still dominate (Fig. 2 and Table 1). In the chrome-spinel assemblage from the mid-Ordovician before the LCPB break-up, we noted an HED/ordinary chondritic ratio a factor two to five higher than in today’s flux. This was inferred to reflect a residual signature after the formation of the Rheasilvia basin at ~1 to 1.7 Ga ago (17). This interpretation was reasonable in light of the great uncertainties in the estimated age of the Rheasilvia basin. The HED meteorites represent the second most-common group in the collections of recently fallen meteorites (representing ~6% of all meteorite falls) (19), and they appear to have held this position through most of the Phanerozoic. Without detailed oxygen isotopic studies for most of the OtC-V grains in our 15 time windows, considerable uncertainty exists in the details regarding the origin of these grains. Our data, however, clearly show that none of the time windows has registered any major achondritic micrometeorite flux increases following a large-scale family-forming or cratering event during the Phanerozoic.

Fig. 2. Extraterrestrial flux data from 15 time windows in the Phanerozoic plotted against 15 asteroid family ages. Only asteroid families of the types known to contain abundant large chrome-spinel grains are plotted. Thirty-one asteroid families contain large chrome-spinel grains formed in the Phanerozoic, but only the 15 largest (>500 members) are plotted here. The largest families (>1,000 members) are highlighted with double circles. Note the close to constant flux of ordinary chondritic micrometeorites through the Phanerozoic with the conspicuous exception of the mid-Ordovician peak following the L-chondrite parent body break-up ~466 Ma (56). The asteroid family ages and errors follow Reiners and Turchyn (11), as well as the number of family members except for Seinajoki, where we follow Spoto et al. (13). The spectral type of the families is based on Reiners and Turchyn (11), except for Seinajoki, Levin, and Harig/Darcydiel, where information is from Spoto et al. (13).
Time Windows and Break-up Events. Arguably, our sampling coverage in the Phanerozoic is not all-encompassing. The Carboniferous to early Jurassic constitutes an ~190-million-y stretch without chromite-spinel data and an asteroid disruption event during this time would probably go unnoticed. However, only one major break-up event occurred during this time: the Merxia asteroid family event in the Carboniferous (Fig. 2). Any break-up after the Triassic would have been recorded in our sampling windows considering the tailing off time of tens of millions of years after the first arrival of dust from a major parent-body break-up. A feasible argument for the discrepancy between asteroid fragmentation events and observed sediment-dispersed chromite-spinel data may be due to the size and the degree of fragmentation of the parent body. Of the six largest chromite-spinel-bearing asteroid families only one, the Massalia family, is younger than 500 million y (Fig. 2). This cratering/disruption event took place during the mid-Jurassic; however, no obvious traces of the event were found in the mid-Jurassic to early Cretaceous time windows (Fig. 2). A possible explanation is that the Massalia family is a cratering family with a typical mass concentration in one or a few members (20). Its two largest members (150 km and 7 km in diameter) constitute 99% of the total mass of its 6,424 members (20), which demonstrates that this disruption was rather limited and probably did not produce enough dust to affect the flux rate on Earth.

On the other hand, the Baptistina asteroid family, comprising 2,500 members, likely formed in mid-Cretaceous times (Fig. 2) and is considered to have an LL-chondritic composition (21, 22). The Cretaceous happens to be our most densely sampled period, but there are no signs at all of a significantly enhanced flux of LL-chondritic chromite-spinel grains in any of our Cretaceous samples. Based on family-member orbital backtracking, other ages, in the range 210 to 140 Ma, have been proposed for the Baptistina break-up (23), but nor in the Jurassic samples from approximately 170 Ma is there a significant (greater than a factor of two) enhancement in the flux of LL-chondritic grains.

Considering the dynamical age of 950 (+200/-170) Ma for the formation of one of the largest asteroid families, the LL-chondritic Flora family (12, 24), we expected to see a significant enhancement of LL-chondritic chromite-spinel grains in any of our Cretaceous samples. Based on family-member orbital backtracking, other ages, in the range 210 to 140 Ma, have been proposed for the Baptistina break-up (23), but nor in the Jurassic samples from approximately 170 Ma is there a significant (greater than a factor of two) enhancement in the flux of LL-chondritic grains.

Instead, H chondrites clearly dominated the flux in the Cambrian, making up 62 to 71% of the ordinary chondrites falling. There is no significant enhancement in the total flux of ordinary chondrite grains in the Cambrian. In the oldest Cambrian window, LL-chondritic grains make up 18% of the ordinary chondrite flux, and 3 million y later LLs represent 14%. This is similar to 12% in today’s flux and to values around 6 to 13% through most of the Phanerozoic (Fig. 3 and SI Appendix, Table S1). Our results indicate that the LL chondrites arriving on Earth today may originate from the same region in the asteroid belt as the H and L chondrites rather than from the Flora family region. Notably, in the mid-Ordovician just before the LCBP break-up, the LL chondrites represent almost a third of the flux (30%). The mid-Ordovician windows also show other unusual features such as the common large (63 to 250 μm) grains from different types of primitive achondrites in pre-LCBP strata (10) and a fossil primitive achondritic

![Fig. 3. Variations through the Phanerozoic in the relative proportions of the three groups of ordinary chondrites based on chrome spinel. Percentages are based on TiO2 values corrected for compositional overlap between the groups. Error bars indicate 1σ uncertainties. See also SI Appendix, SI Text and Tables S1 and S2.](https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.2020977118)
meteorite of a type not previously known among Earth’s meteorite types (25) in post-LCPB strata.

Another conundrum arising from our data is that L-chondritic micrometeorites were commonly falling on Earth even before the LCPB event both in the Cambrian and the mid-Ordovician (Fig. 3, Table 1, and SI Appendix, Table S1). In assemblages representing the time about 1 million y before the LCPB break-up the L chondrites already constitute about one-third of the ordinary chondrites with a flux rate on the same order of magnitude as the Phanerozoic background flux. In the Cambrian time windows, we see some of the lowest L-chondritic percentages of the Phanerozoic, 12 to 17%, but also in the early Paleocene, ~66 to 61 Ma ago, are such low values recorded (26).

In essence, our data show that the meteorite flux has been remarkably stable over time and, except for the LCPB event, none of the asteroid break-ups considered appear to have led to major changes in the meteorite flux to Earth. In particular, the absence in our micrometeorite records of any signatures of the two large Flora and Baptista break-up events, places strong doubts on the validity on present ideas that large family-forming events would have major effects on the delivery of meteoritic material to Earth.

Impact Cratering Record, K-Ar Gas Retention Ages, and ⁴He Data. Based on the chrome-spinel data from the investigated time windows, we argue that asteroid disruption events of such magnitude as to give an order-of-magnitude or more increase in the meteorite flux to Earth over millions of years is exceedingly rare and may have happened only once (after the LCPB event) during the past 500 million y. Admittedly, our chrome-spinel data only give insights about events involving S- and V-type asteroids; however, clues about the flux effects of break-ups involving other types of asteroids as well (e.g., C, X, CX), with only rare large chrome-spinel grains, can be gained from three other records: 1) the age of nonfragile types of meteorites that have fallen on Earth in recent times, and 3) ³He profiles across marine sedimentary sections. We summarize that our interpretations based on chrome spinels about asteroid break-ups and meteorite delivery to Earth are consistent with and supported by these three entirely independent data records.

In compilations of the ages of the ~200 impact craters known on Earth, there is only one resolvable “peak” in crater abundances indicative of an asteroid shower (27). This is a one order-of-magnitude higher number of craters ~470 to 440 Ma compared to other equivalent Paleozoic time bins. Most of these “excess” craters are small, 1 to 10 km in diameter, which is consistent with an origin of a shower of small asteroids from the broken-up ~150-km-large LCPB in the asteroid belt at ~466 Ma. Similarly, in the record of K-Ar gas-retention ages of many types of recently fallen meteorites studied, only one major break-up event is recorded during the Phanerozoic, the break-up of the LCPB ~470 Ma (28–31).

The K-Ar isotope system measures the time when collisional shock effects reset the K-Ar “isotopic clock” by Ar degassing. The K-Ar ages of meteorites are considered to reflect large, catastrophic events of sufficient energy to completely degas a major asteroid parent body. Almost all meteorite types have kept their Ar since when the solar system was young, but the two most common types of meteorites, the L and H chondrites, mostly show Phanerozoic K-Ar ages (31). The L chondrites show one prominent K-Ar age spike ~470 Ma, reflecting one major collisional event, whereas the H-chondrite parent body appears to have experienced a series of smaller collisional events throughout the Phanerozoic (31). The latter circumstance is registered in our data by recurrent returns to H-chondrite dominance among the ordinary chondritic micrometeorites that fell, and not by any major spike in the flux like for the L chondrites ~466 Ma (Fig. 3). Our interpretation of the Phanerozoic chrome-spinel distribution is also consistent with reconstructions of the extraterrestrial ³He content in sedimentary sections. This ³He is considered to represent the most fine-grained (<10-μm) fraction of the extraterrestrial dust arriving on Earth (32). The sedimentary record representing the past 100 Ma has been scanned in great detail for ³He, providing evidence of five anomalies: three in the Late Cretaceous, and two in Cenozoic strata (32–34). However, the anomalies only reflect minor increases in the flux of ³He-carrying dust, typically by a factor two to five over periods of 0.1 to 2 Ma. We have searched three of the ³He-rich intervals for extraterrestrial spinels (>32 μm), but could not detect any micrometeorite flux increases larger than a factor of two (5, 26, 35, 36).

In comparison, in mid-Ordovician strata at the stratigraphic level where the first abundant L-chondritic micrometeorites from the LCPB break-up arrive, there is an increase in the extraterrestrial ³He content by a factor of 240, but apparent gas loss in sediments this old suggests that the true increase may have been even higher (18). In essence, the available data from four different parameters—chrome spinel, impact-crater ages, K-Ar ages of meteorites, and sedimentary ³He—only indicate a single break-up or cratering event (the LCPB break-up) during the Phanerozoic that led to an increase in the flux of meteorites to Earth at the order-of-magnitude level.

The Astronomical Data. Dynamical backtracking studies of the orbits of asteroid family members of all spectral types indicate about 70 major family-forming break-ups the past ~500 Ma (11–14), but our data from the geological record indicate that only one break-up event had any major effects on the accretion of meteorites and small asteroids on Earth. In the light of this, questions arise regarding the validity of the generally accepted delivery mechanisms of micrometeorites, meteorites, and asteroids to Earth. The delivery model is rather complex and is quite different for dust and micrometeorites compared to large bodies, such as meteorites and asteroids. For the large bodies a chain of events is envisioned, including (sequential): collisional break-up, semimajor axis drift induced by Yarkovsky effects (anisotropic heat emission that change the orbits of large objects), thin resonance influence of the eccentricity up to Mars-crossing status and, finally, hurling into an Earth-crossing orbit by a strong resonance (37). For small particles, the solar radiation pressure is believed to be the principal transport force (38, 39). Micrometeoroids (circa 10-μm to 2-mm large) are affected by the tangential component of the solar radiation known as the Poynting–Robertson drag, causing these fragments to coil into the inner solar system and the Sun (39). Therefore, according to theory, small fragments from break-up events in the asteroid belt can drift into Earth-crossing orbits without help from resonances on time scales of 0.1 to 10 Ma, depending on the distance and fragment size (4, 39).

The Provenance of Meteoritic Material Delivered to Earth. Although the ordinary chondrites make up as much as 87% of all recently fallen 63,000 meteorites documented (19), it is still a major conundrum from where in the inner to the middle asteroid belt they originate and why they so strongly dominate the recent flux (7, 8, 40–42). The fact that this dominance has prevailed for the past 500 Ma makes the issue even more elusive. Studies of the present asteroid belt indicate that 85% of all meteoroid debris in the inner asteroid belt is related to five major asteroid families: Flora, Vesta, Nysa, Polana, and Eulalia (43). Of these, the Flora family may be related to the least-common type of ordinary chondrites, the LL chondrites (41). However, none of the other four major families show a clear spectral relation to the abundant H or L chondrites falling on Earth today. A number of parent bodies/families have been proposed for the H and L chondrites, including asteroids Hebe, Juno, Agnia, Merxia, or the Koronis family for the H chondrites, and the Gefion or Ino families for L chondrites, but little agreement exists between different authors (44–49). The place of
origin in the asteroid belt of the bulk of the ordinary chondrites represents a major enigma in meteoritics.

We argue that the present mode of meteorite delivery has been remarkably stable over the past 500 Ma, with the bulk of meteorites persistently originating from a rather restricted region of orbital space in the asteroid belt, but from where remains an enigma. It has been speculated that because most ordinary chondrites fall in the afternoon, their source region may be close to the 3:1 resonance (50). Spectral studies, however, show considerable diversity among asteroid types adjacent to the 3:1 resonance with no clear dominance of ordinary chondrites (51). Major asteroid break-up events in regions far away from resonances likely only result in more modest increases over shorter time scales in the flux of micrometeorites and meteorites to Earth. We know from cosmic-ray exposure (CRE) ages of recently fallen meteorites that the collisional cascade model is applicable on a smaller scale when variations in the flux of the different types of the ordinary chondrites are considered. Whereas K-Ar dates of meteorites reflect major degassing events, the CRE ages measure less energetic collisions when fragmentation creates pieces <1 m, the depth at which cosmic rays can penetrate (52). Recently fallen H, L, and LL chondrites show peak CRE ages of 7, 40, and 15 Ma, respectively, reflecting smaller break-up events successively sending meteorite showers to Earth (52). We note in our data that whereas the total flux of ordinary chondritic micrometeorites has been relatively stable during the past 500 Ma, except after the conspicuous LCPB event, the relations between the different types of ordinary chondrites appear to vary with a turnover rate of a few to tens of millions of years (Fig. 3). This concurs with repeated smaller collisional events like those inducing different CRE ages of the recently fallen ordinary chondrites. The chrome-spinel approach ties Earth’s geological record to the history of the asteroid belt and provides detailed information on orbital dynamics and processes in the asteroid belt not accessible through any other means.

Materials and Methods

Chrome-Spinel Separation. The present study is based on data from 2,828 extraterrestrial chrome-spinel grains 32- to 355-μm large. These grains were extracted from 8,484 kg of Phanerozoic limestone by means of acid dissolution. The extraction procedure is generally the same for all samples, however, the Cambrian, Jurassic and part of the Late Cretaceous data derive from new samples prepared for this study and a description of the chrome-spinel separation method for these follows in a step-by-step fashion. The limestone sample preparation was performed at the Astrogeology Laboratory, Lund University, Sweden. A total of 653 kg of Cambrian limestone, 923 kg of Jurassic limestone, and 397 kg of Late Cretaceous limestone were cleaned with a pressure washer to rid loose material and weathered rock. 823 kg of Jurassic limestone, and 397 kg of Late Cretaceous limestone were extracted from 8,484 kg of Phanerozoic limestone by means of acid dissolution of the calcium carbonate (24 to 72 h), the residue was neutralized with NaOH, sieved through a 32-μm mesh, and dried. The dried residues from the Cambrian samples at this step contained vast amounts of pyrite and in order to dissolve this mineral, these samples were treated with 15.4 M nitric acid (HNO3). The pyrite-free samples were then neutralized with NaOH, sieved through a 32-μm mesh, and dried. The dried remainder was treated with lithium heteropolytungstate dissolved in water (LST) at a relative density of 2.8 g cm-3 in order to remove organic material. The heavy liquid separates the material into a bottom-dwelling heavy fraction and a light fraction at the top of the liquid. The heavy fraction was physically separated from the light-weight fraction by freezing the bottom in liquid nitrogen, after which the liquid at the top (containing the heavy weight fraction) was poured off into a 32-μm mesh, washed, and burned in a furnace at 500 °C. The heavy fraction was thawed with water and divided into two size fractions (32 to 63 μm and 63 to 355 μm, respectively) and searched beneath a stereo microscope for opaque, black grains, which were picked with a fine brush and placed on a carbon tab on a glass slide for further investigation. The burned fraction was treated in the same way. The Jurassic and Cretaceous samples followed the same procedure, except for the HNO3 treatment. Each process in the extraction procedure has been thoroughly tested on Ordovician extraterrestrial chrome-spinel grains in order to ensure that chemical or other treatment leave the grains unaffected. This has been carried out in a before-and-after fashion, where grains of different size fractions have been chemically analyzed and photographed prior to, and after a specific treatment. All steps in the treatment chain left all grains chemically and otherwise unaltered.

Elemental Analysis. Picked grains were analyzed semiquantitatively with a Bruker MinSVE energy-dispersive spectrometer mounted on a Hitachi TM 3030 Table Top scanning electron microscope to pinpoint grains with chrome-spinel composition. The confirmed chrome-spinel grains were mounted in epoxy resin and polished with 1-μm diamond paste. The polished grains were then coated with carbon and quantitatively analyzed for chemical composition with a calibrated Oxford INCA X-Sight energy-dispersive spectrometer with a Si detector, mounted on a Hitachi S-3400N scanning electron microscope. Cobalt was used as a standard to monitor instrumental drift. An acceleration voltage of 15 kV, a sample current of ~1 nA, and a counting live time of 80 s was used. The accuracy of the analyses has been confirmed by interlaboratory tests using certified reference materials (2, 4). Precision of the analyses was typically better than 1 to 4%. Three spots or more were analyzed on each grain, and the average result is used here. Analysis spots were selected away from grain fractures or rims with signs of diagenetic alteration.

Division of Chrome-Spinel Grains into Main Groups. EC. Grains from equilibrated ordinary chondrites (geological types 4 to 6) with oxide weight percentages within the ranges of \( \text{Cr}_2\text{O}_3:3.0\rightarrow8.2; \text{Fe}_2\text{O}_3:23.0 \rightarrow32.0; \text{Al}_2\text{O}_3:4.5\rightarrow8.5; \text{MgO}:1.3\rightarrow4.5; \text{V}_2\text{O}_3:0.55\rightarrow0.95; \text{TiO}_2:1.40\rightarrow4.50 \) (for more extensive discussions, see ref. 1). Small deviations from these values in one or two oxides are marked with red color in the element analyses table (Dataset S1). The FeO values of EC grains can sometimes be lower than 23 wt% because of replacement by MnO and ZnO (see ref. S3). All grains with total FeO content lower than 11.0 wt% are classified as OC-VT grains. These grains may derive from unequilibrated ordinary chondrites.

Outlier EC. Grains that significantly deviate in MgO, but still can be considered an EC grain are put within Outlier EC categories. These grains may have suffered some diagenetic alteration, but generally V2O3 and TiO2 appear not to have been affected. We divide these grains further into two categories: 1) MgO-depleted grains: Low content of MgO (<1.0 wt%) and usually accompanied by an elevated ZnO content. EC-like grains with <0.5 wt% MgO are classified as OTC-V grains. 2) MgO-enriched grains: High content of MgO >6.0 wt% and usually low (<24 wt%) values of MnO+FeO+ZnO. EC-like grains with MgO >9.0 wt% are classified as OTC-V grains. OTC-V. Other chrome spinel: that is, grains that do not have the typical equilibrated ordinary chondritic composition, but contain >0.45 wt% \( \text{V}_2\text{O}_3 \) and a \( \text{Cr}_2\text{O}_3/\text{FeO} \) ratio ≥1.45, indicating a likely meteorite origin. OC. Other chrome-spinel grains, but with \( \text{V}_2\text{O}_3 <0.45 \) wt% or >0.45 wt% \( \text{V}_2\text{O}_3 \) together with a \( \text{Cr}_2\text{O}_3/\text{FeO} \) ratio <1.45. The OTC grains are likely of terrestrial origin.

The OTC and OTC-V grains are the same as the OC and OC-V grains in our previous papers. The acronyms have been changed in order to avoid confusion with the use of the acronym OC for “ordinary chondrite” in other research. The classification system used here has evolved over time. In single cases in earlier work grains that are at the “border” between two of our present categories may have been put in a different category than in the system applied here. These cases are so rare, however, that they have no bearing on any of the conclusions reached at in the present study.

Division of EC Grains in H, L, and LL Groups. The EC grains can also be divided into the three ordinary chondritic groups—H, L, and LL—using the TiO2 concentration (2, 10, 54). The average TiO2 content of the H, L, and LL groups is <2.2, 2.7, and 3.4 wt%, respectively. The TiO2 content follows a Gaussian distribution, with about 10% overlap between the groups. We use the following division: \( \text{H} < 2.50, \text{L} = 2.51 \rightarrow 3.39, \text{and LL} \geq 3.40 \) wt%, respectively. The exact ranges for dividing grains based on TiO2 can in principle be arbitrarily set, but they must be used consistently when comparing different time periods. The EC classification into subgroups can also be done with oxygen-3-isotopic analysis, but it has been shown that the TiO2 approach is as effective as using oxygen isotopes (2, 10, 54). The advantage of using both oxygen isotopes and TiO2 is that uncertainties from compositional overlaps in respective approach can be resolved in greater detail. In
practice, however, isotope and element overlaps tend to cancel each other out, therefore using both methods instead of only TiO₂ will not significantly affect the division of the grains. The 10% overlap in TiO₂ content between the three groups is insignificant when each of the three groups has similar abundances, but when one group strongly dominates, such as the L chondrites after the LCDB break-up, the overlap creates false high numbers of grains in the other groups. We therefore present our data corrected for a 10% overlap in TiO₂ concentrations between groups.

When comparing chromite TiO₂ results between different time windows, the sample sizes vary, which may cause considerable uncertainties, especially for time windows with small number of analyses. In order to compare time windows in a meaningful way, the statistical uncertainty associated with the number of analyses has been estimated (Fig. 3). The probability that an EC concentration in a time window L) is dependent upon both the confidence level assigned (σ) and the total number of grains analyzed (n) in each time window: X̄ₙ = (1−(1−σ)ⁿ/ₙ. Only populations exceeding the detection limit were believed to be a statistically important constituent of the population and valid for further discussion. The expected uncertainty is illustrated as a function of relative abundance of the subgroup population (X) and the total number of grains analyzed (n) in a specific time window: 2σ = 2/√nX̄(1−X̄).

Calculation of Flux (Grains m⁻² ka⁻¹). The extraterrestrial flux (EF) is here expressed as the number of EC-grains of a specific size fraction deposited within a square meter during a time span of 1,000 y. Variables are sedimentation rate (SR) and number of grains per kilogram of rock (N). Constants are the area of deposition and the density of limestone (ρ). The flux equation reads as follows: EF = 100 × 100 × SR × ρ × N, where SR is expressed as centimeters per 1,000 y, N is expressed as grains per kilogram of rock, and ρ is expressed as gram per cubic centimeter of rock. For compilation of data for all windows and discussion on the flux parameters, see SI Appendix, SI Text and Tables S1 and S2.

Data Availability. All study data are included in the article and supporting information.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS. We thank Edward Anders for encouragement, discussions, and comments on an earlier draft; Elifin Martin for providing the additional results for one of the late Cretaceous time windows; Knut Deppert, Per Eriksson, and Per Kristiansson for making the study possible at Lund University; Shiyou Liao for providing helpful comments on error estimates; Faisal Iqbal for assisting in the laboratory; and three anonymous reviewers for comments that improved the manuscript. Support under field work was provided by Federico Oloriz and Victoriano Pujalet in Spain, Luca Martini in Italy, and Samuele Boschi in Sweden. The project was funded by the Knut and Alice Wallenberg Foundation, Swedish Research Council and European Research Council (Advanced Grant ASTROGEOBISPHERE).

Terfret and Schmitz

Asteroid break-ups and meteorite delivery to Earth the past 500 million years